



International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



Human Rights Council

Topic: Discussing police immunity and corruption within national law enforcement agencies through the lens of human rights violations

Moderator: Matilde Garza

Director: Lorena Saide

I. Committee Background

The United Nations Human Rights Council (UNHRC) was established on March 16, 2006, by the General Assembly. Its purpose is to promote and strengthen the protection of human rights outlined in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and address situations where these rights are violated. The council's meetings occur in the United Nations (UN) offices in Geneva, where members gather to discuss human rights issues that require immediate attention. The UN General Assembly is responsible for electing all 47 UN Member States that make up the council, as it is an inter-governmental body that functions within the UN's system (*United Nations, 2020*). The Human Rights Council has four distinct assets that contribute to the improvement of human rights conditions around the globe: the Universal Periodic Review, which assesses human rights situations in all member states; the Advisory Committee, which provides the council with advice and tactics to overcome an issue regarding the violation of human rights; the Complaint Procedure, in charge of allowing individuals to bring attention to situations regarding human rights; and the Special Procedures, which examine and monitor existing conflicts (*United Nations, 2020*).

II. Introduction

Description and Definition of the Topic

The Legal Information Institute of Cornell defines police immunity within national law enforcement agencies as “a judicially created doctrine that shields government officials from being held personally liable for constitutional violations— like the right to be free from the excessive police force” (Sobel, 2020). In other words, these types of laws shield local government officials, such as police officers, from being sued by people alleging they violated their rights, except in cases where “the official violated a ‘clearly established’ natural, legal, or constitutional right” (Longley, 2022). The difference between the two is that a civil lawsuit is a proceeding by a party against another in the civil court of law where the dispute can be settled. At the same time, criminal prosecution charges an individual with a crime and puts them on trial (United States Courts, 2022).

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immunns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



Police immunity has allowed police officers to use excessive force without consequence. A 2020 Reuters investigation revealed that qualified immunity, alongside the U.S. Supreme Court's continual refinements to legislation, has made it easier for police officers to kill or injure civilians with impunity (Chung, 2022). Consequently, officers have “less reason to improve their procedures and to train to respect civil rights,” jeopardizing the safety and justice of civilians (Longley, 2022). In order to receive any form of recognition, victims of police mistreatment must first show that the offending officers violated an established law by citing a specific case involving the same conduct. However, this is an extended process, which makes it easier for courts to discard the case by demonstrating that there is no legal precedent in the form of “nearly identical cases” (Longley, 2022). To many, this is a clear sign of corruption undermining human rights, causing more problems as they have “an impact on the safety of citizens and their pursuit of justice” (Council of Europe and Strasbourg, 2021). Nonetheless, if police immunity is implemented correctly, citizens may have a chance at safety while officers can do their jobs effectively.

The Problem

Qualified immunity was created “to protect government employees from frivolous lawsuits” (Eji, 2020). However, law enforcement officials have abused this. (Guzman, n.d). Established law, according to the US Supreme Court, “cannot be articulated with a high degree of generality; rather, the law must be “particularized” to the facts of the case. Because of qualified immunity, courts frequently rule that even when someone’s rights are violated, there is no legal resource available because the law was not clearly defined, meaning that courts can award qualified immunity without ever determining whether a constitutional violation occurred. This makes it possible for people in power and government officials to take advantage of the system and not take accountability for violence and misconduct.

Subsequently, it seems that qualified immunity substantially weakens the government’s responsibility to protect its citizens and routinely fails to provide justice to victims whose rights have been violated. Because this doctrine uses the term “clearly establish” to determine if the crime violates the law, many government officials’ lawsuits are overturned by manipulating this vague term (Schweikert, 2020). These large amounts of protests worldwide seem to suggest citizens dislike qualified immunity, especially in the United States, despite the reasons for its creation. For many, it makes them feel unsafe around law enforcement. It is up to this committee to evaluate qualified immunity, determine if it poses a general threat to society, and protect human rights worldwide— lest people continue to live in fear of the institution meant to protect them.

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



III. History of the Topic

Chronological History of the Topic

The first significant recorded example of a corrupt legal system dates back to Egypt's First Dynasty, where the government in power had multiple issues regarding the loyalty of its officials, one of the most prevalent of these being bribery among the higher ranks of the Egyptian government. This directly contradicted the values and laws that the civilization held, where it was believed that society needed to represent truth and honesty. However, the issue was not isolated to Egypt and could be seen in Ancient China and other ancient civilizations like ancient Greece and Rome. Rome, for example, was infamous for its murders among the higher members of its society as part of political intrigue and a desire to gain more individual power. Instead of being resolved, this helped in the decline and helped bring about the downfall of the Roman Empire. According to Benjamin Morrison, a writer for Brock University, "the largest influencing factor on the fall of the Roman Republic was political corruption and instability" (Morrison, n.d). Malpractice on behalf of legal authorities in human history has not changed significantly over time. Throughout the next two millennia there were numerous accounts of corruption throughout the world. That being said, in the 20th Century though there were some serious issues of note.

The beginning of the 1900s irreversibly altered society's dynamic: "As the global economy expanded significantly during the 20th century, levels of corruption increased as well" (Biswas, 2018). Although the level of corruption observed on behalf of law enforcement, and by extension, the government, had most definitely existed before the modern age. With the growth of fiat currency and global expansion, corruption worldwide has worsened. Because of this, "it is difficult to estimate the global magnitude and extent of corruption since these activities are carried out in secret" (The Conversation, n.d). A well-known example of this is World War II, where soldiers were given free rein to do what they saw fit, for example when "in March 1938, Austrian Nazis broke into Jewish homes, threw out inhabitants, and looted the contents; Jews were stopped on the streets and robbed of their fur coats, jewelry, and wallets" (Evans, n.d). The immunity these officers were given is a demonstration of the lack of accountability officers in power have been given throughout history, and how this risks the safety of civilians. New York, for example, is no stranger to violence perpetrated by its police department. One incident of police corruption in the United States includes the Chicago case of 1969, when Chicago's African American community led protests against racism near Tilden High School until "two hundred policemen, along with a mob of about one hundred hostile whites, swarmed the school after catching the drift of the conflict. The policemen, all of whom were white, began stomping, clubbing, and kicking the unarmed African American students" (Agyepong, 2013). In 1997, a city report disclosed how a Haitian immigrant was taken to the New York Police Department bathroom, beaten dangerously, and sodomized after his arrest on August 9. Recently, violence resulting in police immunity remains present. A famous example is France, where police brutality is often tied to racism and xenophobia. The country has a history of Islamophobia, such

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190

TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



as a ban on burqas and niqabs in public spaces. Furthermore, French citizens have held protests against police killings in recent months. Other countries, such as Iran, Iraq, Sudan, Hong Kong, and Nicaragua, have been seen actively “[authorizing] heavy-handed police responses to protests and demonstrations” (Amnesty International). Human rights have been established to prevent incidents like the previous one from occurring again; however, it would be incorrect to believe that these new rights have cleansed law enforcement of their corruption.

Historical Case Studies

Johnny Leija Case

On March 24, 2011, Johnny Leija was murdered in the United States by the police at age 34; the officers covered their crime with qualified immunity. The incident occurred when he was hospitalized in Medill, Oklahoma, due to severe pneumonia and dehydration; he was so disoriented that he demanded that the doctors let him go home. Johnny even shouted, “that he was ‘Superman’ and ‘God’ and that he believed medical personnel were trying to kill him” (Fernandez, 2021). Consequently, the hospital staff called law enforcement to help them control Leija and prevent him from being violent with others. As medical staff planned on administering Leija an injection to calm him down, the three Marshal County officers struggled to hold the patient down. Thus, officers used a stun gun on him, killing him with it. The Oklahoma Chief Medical Examiner’s Office “determined that Leija, having his lungs already compromised by pneumonia, was starved for oxygen in his struggle with the police and died from ‘respiratory insufficiency” (Chung, 2020). The county sheriff and the police chief defended the officers’ actions since they believed they were appropriate for this situation; therefore, the cops were not charged. Erma Aldaba, Leija’s mom, blamed the officers for their son’s death and sued the police. The lawsuit claimed that the officers used excessive force and violated her son’s civil rights under the Fourth Amendment to the U.S. Constitution; nonetheless, her lawsuit faced the obstacle of qualified immunity. Aldaba believed that she could win the case because after the lawyers heard her case, the federal appeals court rejected the officer’s claim of qualified immunity. The evidence demonstrated that “the officers used excessive force in violation of the Fourth Amendment,” and they proved how the “officers should have known they were breaking ‘clearly established’ law.” Due to this, the officers requested for the Supreme Court to intervene, influencing the appeals court to reconsider its ruling. Moments later, Leija’s case was ignored entirely, and the court assured that “the cops had no reason to think they were breaking the law” (Chung, 2020). As a result, the case was closed, and the three officers who killed Johnny Leija received qualified immunity, making the charges disappear. In other words, no justice was given to him or his family, although it was clear that the three police officers who killed him were 100% guilty.

Mesa vs. Hernandez

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190

TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



In 2010, Hernández was shot at least twice by Mesa, a U.S. Border Patrol agent who was on duty and stationed at the border in El Paso, Texas. The teenager, a citizen of Mexico, was in Ciudad Juarez at the time, on the southern side of the border. Whether Hernández's parents, who are also Mexican citizens, have the right to sue Mesa for damages in the death that took place outside of U.S. territory is in dispute and at the center of a legal debate in the U.S. Supreme Court has been seeking to decide for over three years. The parents advocated that the teenager's Fourth and Fifth Amendment rights, which guarantee safeguards for due process and protect against arbitrary search and seizure, were violated by the federal agent's disproportionate use of force. The court's ruling was: The Hernández family cannot file a lawsuit. This is because Mesa was protected by the police immunity granted in the United States. Mesa said he shot Hernandez because he feared for his life after being attacked by the boy's rocks. A videotape of the deadly occurrence refutes that narrative. The doctrine eliminated the possibility of consequences for the officer; therefore, the Hendez family will never have justice.

Jerome Harrell Case

On February 23, 2012, a US citizen from Minnesota named Jerome Harrell turned himself in with the desire to “come clean” about a recent murder. The two jail guards, Mary Armstrong and Patrick Culloton, were assigned to him, ensuring he stayed healthy and mentally stable during his time at the Stearns County Jail, where Harrell had turned himself in. However, during his incarceration and questioning, he frequently exhibited odd behaviors such as high anxiety, unintelligible noises, and banging on his cell door. This would be noticed by the two jail guards in multiple instances; however, they did not call in medical assistance. The following day, Harrell was “completely naked with a wet sheet draped over his head as he screamed, made loud howling noises; and pounded on the door” (Prison Legal News, n.d). Medical staff, having been called, requested that the inmate be restrained onto a chair. In the forceful process of locking Harrell into the chair, he resisted by physically tackling the jailers, refusing to obey, and biting one of the guards. This resulted in one jail official using a stun-mode Taser on Harrell twice. Not long after, he was on the floor, unresponsive. After several failed attempts to revive the inmate, they managed to rush him to a hospital, where he was declared dead. As a result, lawsuits were filed against the jailers present that night, though these claims were later “granted summary judgment to the defendants on all the federal claims then dismissed the state law claims without prejudice” (Prison Legal News, n.d). In other words, the case against the defendants, the jailers, was terminated without a full trial, and the claims made against the state were also dismissed. Though the results of these suits would change after appeals years later, this case was first dismissed quickly using qualified immunity, serving as a prime example of how the state can ignore violence through its use.

Bloody Sunday in Northern Ireland

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



On January 30, 1972, in the Bogside, a neighborhood in Londonderry with a high catholic population, members of the Army's Parachute Regiment opened fire on civil rights marchers, leaving 13 people dead and at least 15 more hurt. That day is now known as Bloody Sunday, one of the worst days of the Troubles in Northern Ireland. A few months earlier, due to rising violence and unsafety in the country, the government decided to introduce a law that allowed authorities to imprison anyone for whichever reason, as they believed it would "restore order" (BBC, 2022). The Irish were outraged and decided to rally on a Sunday, despite the government's effort to ban protests. An hour later, soldiers responded with rubber bullets, tear gas, and water cannon, which killed two men immediately. Later on, soldiers began to fire. According to Army evidence, "21 soldiers fired their weapons, discharging 108 live rounds between them" (BBC). The shootings sparked intense resentment in Derry and other nearby places. An angry mob destroyed the British Embassy in Dublin by setting it on fire. The government declared an investigation would be conducted under the direction of Lord Chief Justice Lord Widgery the day after Bloody Sunday. Although he called the soldiers' shooting "bordering on the reckless", the Widgery Tribunal mostly cleared the soldiers and British officials of blame. The families of the victims who had spent years pushing for a new public investigation, decided it as a whitewash. Lord Saville, a judge, would lead a new inquiry, according to Minister Tony Blair's announcement. The investigation started in 1998 and it was completed in 2010, making it the most expensive and longest running in British legal history. The investigation revealed that none of the victims were acting in a way that would have justified shooting them. According to the report, no civilians received a warning before the soldiers started shooting, and none of the soldiers fired in response to stone-throwers or people who were throwing gasoline bombs at them. Although there was "some gunfire by republican paramilitaries," according to Saville, the Army generally opened fire first. The killings, said to Prime Minister David Cameron, were "unjustified and unjustifiable". Following the publication of the Saville report, the Police Service of Northern Ireland (PSNI) opened a murder inquiry. It took several years to finish, and around the end of 2016, detectives handed their files over to the Public Prosecution Service. Prosecutors declared on March 14 that they would charge soldier F (the identity of the soldier has never been revealed) with the killings of James Wray and William McKinney after considering 125,000 pages of evidence. In addition, he had been accused of attempting to kill Patrick O'Donnell, Joseph Friel, Joe Mahon, and Michael Quinn. Following a decision by the Public Prosecution Service, it was announced on July 2, 2021, that Soldier F would not go to trial. The PPS stated in a statement that the decision had been made following "careful consideration" because of another recent court decision determined that certain evidence used to support the prosecution of Soldiers A and C for the murder of Joe McCann was inadmissible. This was caused by the circumstances surrounding the gathering of the evidence. A legal challenge filed by the brother of one of the Bloody Sunday victims resulted in the decision to not move further with the case being the subject of ongoing judicial review processes.

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



Past UN Actions

The United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) is the largest universal convention held to combat corruption within a country's government, including government malpractice regarding Law Enforcement agencies. The convention was split into four sections, each tackling a different aspect of the issue: preventative measures, criminalization And law enforcement measures, international cooperation, and asset recovery. The convention promotes the use of third-party organizations to prevent future corruption cases. This would reduce the risk of inner-government bribery and influence. Furthermore, the convention encourages countries to raise awareness about corruption and its effects. The United Nations Convention against Corruption (UNCAC) requires that its participants establish offenses built specifically around corruption and expand existing laws to cover a more extensive array of possible offenses and crimes, including money laundering, trading in influence, and obstructing justice.

Countries that agree to cooperate with the convention's establishments are "bound by the Convention to render specific forms of mutual legal assistance in gathering and transferring evidence for use in court, to extradite offenders" (United Nations, 2003). One of the biggest breakthroughs to have transpired within this convention is the affirmation that actions toward Asset Recovery will occur. As the name suggests, Asset Recovery consists of repairing and reforming a country's systems to conform with the new policies. In this case, every country must come closer to the laws and regulations put in place by the convention. Asset Recovery will also "support the efforts of countries to redress the worst effects of corruption while sending at the same time, a message to corrupt officials that there will be no place to hide their illicit assets" (United Nations, 2003).

All in all, the convention was a global success in many aspects. Not only because of its universally respected rules but also because of its solid demands for its participants. Both on paper and in practice, the solutions presented are very effective because of how strict they are.

IV. Key Players and Points of View

United States

In 1871, Congress passed a law allowing lawsuits against state and local officials who failed to defend African Americans from lynchings and other acts of racial violence by organizations like the Ku Klux Klan— or even took part in them— Americans gained the first legal authority to hold police officers accountable for their actions. In order to allegedly shield government employees from unjustified lawsuits, the Supreme Court announced qualified immunity as a legal principle in 1967. This has affected many officials. Qualified immunity encourages government officials to do their job better with impunity; however, because many police misuse their power and many innocents do not have justice, it is a controversial issue in this nation. (Equal Justice Initiative, n.d). Recently, after the tragic death of George Floyd,

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



dozens of states have tried to end this principle but have failed (Kindy, 2021). President Joe Biden has been in office for more than a year; nevertheless, he has yet to implement the “long-promised policy changes” in the United States he proposed, disappointing Black civil rights groups and community organizers (Roberts, 2022).

Nigeria

Nigeria has declared the absolute prohibition of police torture by creating the Convention against Torture (CAT). This convention obligates states to take adequate measures to prevent acts of torture within their jurisdiction. They also follow the Anti-Torture Act, which “imposes a penalty of up to 25 years imprisonment for perpetrators” (Zinat Jimada, 2021). There have always been legal safeguards against arbitrary arrest and detention for oversight of the Nigerian Police Force (NPF);. However, although all these laws exist, torture and qualified immunity are still widespread, demonstrating how the Nigerian authorities take advantage of their power and use it unfairly. An example is when Kofi Bartels, a Nigerian journalist, filmed three police officers from the Special Anti-Robbery Squad (SARS) beating up an innocent man and then turning their attention to him. He described being beaten up and arrested; this account is one of the many that have sparked protests in the country with the hashtag ‘EndSARS.’ The start of SARS was in 1992, and it was formed to combat armed robbery and other crimes; since then, they have been accused “of harassing and physically abusing thousands of civilians” with no consequence whatsoever (Sada Malumfashi, 2020). Due to all the protests, the Nigerian government announced that they would disband the unit; however, no change has been made. According to Amnesty International, “the Nigeria Police Force (NPF) is responsible for hundreds of extrajudicial executions, other unlawful killings and enforced disappearances each year” (Amnesty International, 2020). Although the government is aware of its qualified immunity’s negative aspects, no change has been made, and this has caused all citizens to protest against its corruption.

Canada

Furthermore, “although Indigenous children represent 7.7% of all children in Canada, they represent 52% of all foster children in the child welfare system” (Stelkia, 2020). After reviewing police shootings in all of 2021, experts agree there has been little to no progress on police accountability and police corruption. Between January 1 and November 30, 2021, “on-duty police officers fired at 64 people [...] and 32 were killed” (Malone). Additionally, officers are generally sent out to check on someone that could have a mental health concern. However, nine fatal police shootings started as wellness checks in 2020. Each Canadian province has a different police shooting history. After five police shootings in Winnipeg, there were none in 2021, compared to Toronto with six, Ontario with five, and Quebec and Alberta with four, meaning it would be of help to observe what officers in Winnipeg are doing differently and create a national database with information on police shootings in the country. Finally,

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



structural racism and police brutality, and corruption in a country considered one of the safest in the world is still prevalent, and not enough has been done to end it.

Although political leaders in Canada claim that the country is not racist, there is evidence that it is. Indigenous people and Black people make up the majority of police-related crimes. As of 2017, one-third of indigenous people were shot to death by RCMP police. Additionally, a black person in Canada is 20 times more likely to be killed by the police than a white person, at least according to the Ontario Human Rights Commission (Stelkia, 2020). Therefore, help and protection do not apply to people of color or indigenous people in Canada, despite the beliefs that it does.

France

France's established laws are close to the international standard and are an excellent example of countries' common views regarding police immunity. The country has adhered to many treaties and signings, including the 1984 Convention against Torture (CAT) seen before, the 1966 Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), and optional protocols for both. These treaties are signed for better police regulation and compliance with international standards. France charges significant fines for law enforcement officers who do not comply with these rules. An officer can receive a fine of €45,000 and up to 3 years of imprisonment if they exhibit negligence with a firearm and commit homicide. Unnecessary brutality or violence, however, has a much larger punishment. Committing this crime can have the officer imprisoned for up to ten years and a fine of €150,000. France has also established an Ombudsman, an individual tasked with overseeing the people's rights.

In 2011, police arrested 53 individuals at a music concert. These detained people were indoors and suffered the effects of tear gas from the police. Six years later, in 2017, the Ombudsman publicly denounced the police for their use of the gas, as it "did not respect set procedure, nor was it necessary in the circumstances according to the decision" (Law on Police Use of Force Worldwide 2021). This is an example of police brutality in the country, which treaty bodies of the United Nations have brought up. Both the Human Rights Committee and the Committee against Torture called on France to take action by "[adopting] effective measures, particularly in terms of training, to prevent law enforcement and security forces from using excessive force or non-lethal weapons in situations that do not warrant recourse to greater or lethal force" (United Nations, 2015). Though the country is making multiple attempts to conform to the United Nations standards, it still has issues regarding the severity of its officers' methods and actions. Racism within the law enforcement of France is one of these issues. For example, two years ago, on November 28, 2020, a severe case of police brutality was spotted on the streets of France, where four white police officers detained and beat an unarmed black performer. In 2021, in another case, Boubacar Dramé, a French citizen with black skin, was mistaken as the culprit of a crime that someone else had called the police for, having nothing to

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



do with him. In summary, France is making long strides towards a more just law enforcement and government, though it still has unresolved issues.

India

Police immunity in India is granted “under Section 197 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973”, which states that when a police officer is accused of committing an offense while or in the discharge of their duty, they are not guilty (Ravi Singh Chhikara, 2021). It is common for authorities to deny sanctions to cops due to political reasons, and because of this, no justice is given to the victims. Apart from this, the court process is long and complicated to make victims avoid officers. If they approach the trial court, they are asked to get the Center’s sanction “and, if the trial court takes up the case, it is faced with the difficulty in determining whether the alleged offense was committed by the accused police officer(s) in the discharge of official duty” (Ravi Singh Chhikara, 2021). Due to this, numerous victims in India have experienced police brutality and never got justice for it. Since the authorities have qualified immunity to protect all their actions, they have recently been using excessive and unnecessary force on citizens. The 2020 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices: India mentioned how there have been “unlawful and arbitrary killings, including extrajudicial killings perpetrated by the police and torture and cases of cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment” (India - United States Department of State, 2021). An example occurred on June 23, 2020, Ponraj Jeyaraj and his son died during police custody in Tamil Nadu. They were arrested for violating COVID-19 regulations, and “the police beat them and they subsequently died from their injuries”; as a result, the officers were not arrested. (India - United States Department of State, 2021). The government has not abolished Section 197 because it uses the police to harass human rights and social activists. They have created laws against acts like organizing protests, giving the police more reason to use excessive force on every person who uses freedom of speech. If the country remains like this, then no justice will ever be given to its citizens.

V. Possible Solutions

The purpose of this committee is to come up with solutions that can tackle this current issue to be able to eliminate corruption within national law enforcement agencies through the lens of human rights violations.

According to critics, qualified immunity has given law enforcement officials the freedom to violate resident’s rights, particularly those who lack voting rights, without being held accountable. That is why one solution would be to abolish this doctrine as a whole; however, this law remains significant as it shields law enforcement from frivolous civil claims by this principle. Two states in the US, Colorado and New Mexico, have passed legislation that bans qualified immunity to protect citizens from corruption and give all justice. These states claim that police

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



have been more conscious and careful on the job because they are accountable for their actions (Tobert, 2022). However, the limitation that the abolishment of this principle holds is that removing qualified immunity might expose law enforcement to unnecessary litigation, which might result in judges and juries overturning split-second decisions costing cities, police departments, and other public authorities much money. Nonetheless, many assert that removing this doctrine will prevent law enforcement corruption and ensure justice, despite any other repercussions.

As stated above, justice is determined if the officer's violation of the law is “clearly established.” This vague term establishes whether the officer is convicted of a felony and if justice is served. Therefore redefining this term by stating what actions are considered a felony and which are protected by qualified immunity can help differentiate when an officer was doing their job vs. when they were abusing qualified immunity and their power. On the other hand, the purpose of the unclear term is “to protect officials from liability that could hamper their ability to do their jobs and subject their game-time decisions to a judicial system “ill-suited” to make such second guesses”(Baker, 2022). This shows that the drawback to this approach may subject law enforcement to needless lawsuits.

These are only legislative solutions. Another way to ensure the removal of corruption and human rights violations is with specific training and reforms on police processes. “Constant training will improve officer conduct and greatly develop their interpersonal skills throughout the department by improving competence, communications, and confidence” hence, this idea hopes to prevent government officials from corruption and violations of human rights (McHenry, n.d). On the contrary, police work and training are very demanding, which is why adding extra discipline can significantly affect officers mentally by creating additional pressure and stress.

These are just a few solutions with limitations that can be implemented to eliminate corruption and human rights violations within governmental agencies.

VI. Current Status

On June 19, 2020, the United Nations Human Rights Council passed a resolution that mandated that the UN high commissioner for human rights and other UN experts make a global report on the excessive use of force by police, especially those against people of African descent by law enforcement. More specifically, the resolution calls for focus on the death of George Floyd in the report and “to contribute to accountability and redress for the victims” (Riera, 2020). The Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials was adopted on December 17, 1979, and has eight articles stating what the police should or should not do. Each article is specific; for example, Article 3 states that “law enforcement officials may use force only when strictly necessary and to the extent required for the performance of their duty” (Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials, n.d). However, attempts in the past to rectify the problem have not

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



been proven successful, such as statements or commentaries to countries such as the U.S. Police bribery and complicity of the police in the drug trade are more specific, targeted problems that have also been addressed yet need more public attention. Even though the problem may seem to be improving slowly, according to Mapping Police Violence, police have killed 84 fewer people in the U.S. through April 2022 compared to the same period in the previous year (Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials, n.d).

Currently, there is a disconnection between citizens and law enforcement agencies, for example the ACAB movement that is used for dissidents- citizens that are against official policy- in order for them to express their discontent with the authority. The movement surfaced after the murder of George Floyd on May 2020. Such lack of understanding and trust between citizens and police results in the former violating rules and protesting, and the police storming protests and potentially harming those protesting. Additionally, it is important for both sides to acknowledge that the Black Lives Matter (the movement that began after the murder of George Floyd) movement's overall goal is to bring about significant change by educating people about how the system is intrinsically prejudiced against black people. When people state ACAB, it fully shifts the burden to the police as a fundamental institution, erasing the presence of such bias.

Ultimately, as a committee it is of the most importance to admit that both citizens, most specifically those who overly generalize about police, and the police itself must come together to realize the human rights that are violated through corruption and immunity, and enforce laws to protect and for there to be trust. Most police corruption may potentially come from the fact that there is a significant lack of trust between the sides. A call to the problem cannot be made unless all perspectives of the problem are discussed and accepted.

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



VII. Bibliography

(2022, May 15). Mapping Police Violence. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://mappingpoliceviolence.org/>

Biswas, A. K., & Tortajada, C. (2018, September 7). *From our ancestors to modern leaders, all do it: the story of corruption*. The Conversation. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://theconversation.com/from-our-ancestors-to-modern-leaders-all-do-it-the-story-of-corruption-102164>

Bloody Sunday: What Happened on Sunday 30 January 1972? (2022, January 27). BBC News. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.bbc.com/news/uk-northern-ireland-foyle-west-47433319>.

Chung, A. (2020, May 8). *Special Report: For cops who kill, special Supreme Court protection*. Reuters. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-police-immunity-scotus-specialrep-idUSKBN22K18C>

Chung, A. (2022, October 11). *U.S. Supreme Court rebuffs challenge to police qualified immunity defense*. Reuters. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.reuters.com/legal/us-supreme-court-rebuffs-challenge-police-qualified-immunity-defense-2022-10-11/>

Civil Cases | United States Courts. (2022). U.S. Courts. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.uscourts.gov/about-federal-courts/types-cases/civil-cases>

Code of Conduct for Law Enforcement Officials. (1979, December 17). ohchr. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.ohchr.org/en/instruments-mechanisms/instruments/code-conduct-law-enforcement-officials>

Council of Europe & Stratasbourg. (2021, January 19). *Corruption undermines human rights and the rule of law*. The Council of Europe. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



<https://www.coe.int/en/web/commissioner/-/corruption-undermines-human-rights-and-the-rule-of-law>

El-Saady, H. (1998). Considerations on Bribery in Ancient Egypt. *Studien Zur Altägyptischen Kultur*, 25, 295–304. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/25152765>

Evans, R. J. (n.d.). *Corruption and Plunder in the Third Reich*. Richard J Evans. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.richardjevans.com/lectures/corruption-plunder-third-reich>

Fawbush, J. (2022, September 28). *Qualified Immunity: Both Sides of the Debate*. Findlaw. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://supreme.findlaw.com/supreme-court-insights/pros-vs-cons-of-qualified-immunity--both-sides-of-debate.html>

France. (2021, April 16). *Law on police use of force in France*. The Law on Police Use of Force. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.policinglaw.info/country/france>

Gilna, D. (2018, January 8). *Eighth Circuit Vacates Summary Judgment Order in Detainee's Wrongful Death Suit*. Prison Legal News. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.prisonlegalnews.org/news/2018/jan/8/eighth-circuit-vacates-summary-judgment-order-detainees-wrongful-death-suit/>

Gold, M. (2019, June 6). *Stonewall Riot Apology: Police Actions Were 'wrong', Commissioner Admits*. New York Times. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/06/06/nyregion/stonewall-riots-nypd.html>

Guzman, J. (n.d.). *Five times police used qualified immunity to get away with misconduct and violence*. naacpldf. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.naacpldf.org/qi-police-misconduct/>.

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



Guzman, J. (2021, November 8). *How Police Use Qualified Immunity to Get Away with Misconduct and Violence*. Legal Defense Fund. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.naacpldf.org/qi-police-misconduct/>

India - United States Department of State. (2021, March 30). State Department. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.state.gov/reports/2020-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/india/>

Jimada, Z. (2021). *Addressing Police Brutality in Nigeria — A Crisis of Non-Implementation*. OHRH. Retrieved December <<<<<<<<<7, 2022, from <https://ohrh.law.ox.ac.uk/addressing-police-brutality-in-nigeria-a-crisis-of-non-implementation/%E2%80%8C>

Kindy, K. (2021, October 7). *Dozens of states have tried to end qualified immunity. Police officers and unions helped beat nearly every bill*. The Washington Post. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from https://www.washingtonpost.com/politics/qualified-immunity-police-lobbying-state-legislatures/2021/10/06/60e546bc-0cdf-11ec-aea1-42a8138f132a_story.html

Larry, M. (2022, June 15). *What Happened at the Stonewall Riots?* What Happened at the Stonewall Riots? A Timeline of the 1969 Uprising. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.history.com/news/stonewall-riots-timeline>

Longley, R. (2022, July 29). *What Is Qualified Immunity? Definition and Examples*. ThoughtCo. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.thoughtco.com/qualified-immunity-definition-and-examples-5081905>

Macron to increase oversight of police after brutality and racism claims. (2021, September 13). France 24. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.france24.com/en/france/20210913-macron-to-increase-oversight-of-police-after-brutality-and-racism-claims>

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immun.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



Malone, K. G. (2021, December 27). *Year in review: Still too many police shootings in Canada, experts say*. CBC. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

<https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/canada-year-end-police-shootings-1.6298888>

Morrison, B. (2022, April 11). *Murder, Greed, and Corrupt Politicians: The Fall of the Roman Republic | The General: Brock University Undergraduate Journal of History*. Brock University Open Journal System. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

<https://journals.library.brocku.ca/index.php/bujh/article/view/3672>

Police Violence. (2022, October 31). Amnesty International. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

<https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/police-brutality/>

Qualified Immunity. (n.d.). Equal Justice Initiative. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

<https://eji.org/issues/qualified-immunity/>

Qualified immunity | Wex | US Law | LII / Legal Information Institute. (2022).

Law.Cornell.Edu. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

https://www.law.cornell.edu/wex/qualified_immunity

Riera, M. (2020, July 20). *UN Condemns Systemic Racism, Police Violence*. Human Rights Watch. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

<https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/07/20/un-condemns-systemic-racism-police-violence-0>

Roberts, W. (2022, May 12). *oe Biden struggles to take action on US police reform*. Aljazeera.

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/5/17/joe-biden-struggles-to-take-action-on-us-police-reform>
<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2022/5/17/joe-biden-struggles-to-take-action-on-us-police-reform>

Sada, M. (2020, October 22). *Nigeria's SARS: A brief history of the Special Anti-Robbery Squad*. Al Jazeera. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from

<https://www.aljazeera.com/features/2020/10/22/sars-a-brief-history-of-a-rogue-unit>

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



- Schweikert, J. (2020, September 14). *Qualified Immunity: A Legal, Practical, and Moral Failure*. Cato. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.cato.org/policy-analysis/qualified-immunity-legal-practical-%20moral-failure#stringency-clearly-established-law>.
- Singh, R. (2021, July 21). *Justice can't breathe! Time to revisit immunity granted to cops in India*. The Leaflet. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://theleaflet.in/justice-cant-breathe-time-to-revisit-immunity-granted-to-cops-in-india/>
- Sobel, N. (2020, June 6). *What Is Qualified Immunity, and What Does It Have to Do With Police Reform?* Lawfare Blog. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.lawfareblog.com/what-qualified-immunity-and-what-does-it-have-to-do-with-police-reform>
- Song, V. (2021, June 11). *France Is Set to Explode With Anger Over Police Brutality*. VICE. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.vice.com/en/article/5dbdj8/france-is-set-to-explode-with-anger-over-police-brutality>
- Stelkia, K. (2022, July 12). *Police Brutality in Canada: A symptom of Structural Racism and Colonial Violence*. Yellowhead Institute. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://yellowheadinstitute.org/2020/07/15/police-brutality-in-canada-a-symptom-of-structural-racism-and-colonial-violence>
- Tera Agyepong. (2013). IN THE BELLY OF THE BEAST: BLACK POLICEMEN COMBAT POLICE BRUTALITY IN CHICAGO, 1968–1983. *The Journal of African American History*, 98(2), 253–276. <https://doi.org/10.5323/jafriamerhist.98.2.0253>
- The Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica. (2022, October 20). *Stonewall riots*. Britannica. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://www.britannica.com/event/Stonewall-riots>.

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org





International Monterrey Model United Nations Simulation

American School Foundation of Monterrey



Tobert, W. (2022, February 28). *Federal Immunity for Rogue Officers Bypassed By State Laws*. San Quentin News. Retrieved December 7, 2022, from <https://sanquentinnews.com/federal-immunity-for-rogue-officers-bypassed-by-state-laws>

AVE. MORONES PRIETO 1500 • SANTA CATARINA, N.L. MÉXICO 66190
TELEPHONE: (81) 8288-4400 • FAX: (81) 8288-4455

www.immuns.org

